دور الإبداع التكنولوجي في تحقيق الميزة التنافسية في البنوك التجارية دراسة حالة عينة من البنوك التجارية

Khedir Oussama ¹, Saidi Chaimaa ², Seddiki Wahida ³

University of Mascara - Mascara (Algéria), oussama.khadir@univ-mascara.dz
 University of Saida - Saida (Algéria), chaimaa.saidi@stu.univ-saida.dz
 University of Sidi Belabbes - Sidi Belabbes (Algéria), seddiki_wahida@yahoo.fr

Received: 27/07/2023 **Accepted:** 26/09/2023 **Published:** 06/01/2024

Abstract:

This study aims to find out the extent to which technological innovation contributes to achieving competitive advantage at the level of Algerian commercial banks, by applying samples of commercial bank members in the state of Saida, collecting data and trying to identify the role of technological innovation in creating and supporting the competitive position of these commercial banks.

Keywords: technological innovation, competitive advantage, commercial banks, Algeria **JEL Classification Codes**: L66, M10, M15, O55

الملخص:

تحدف هذه الدراسة إلى معرفة مدى إسهام الإبداع التكنولوجي في تحقيق الميزة التنافسية على مستوى البنوك التجارية الجزائرية، ومن خلال إسقاط الاختيار على عينة متكونة من 54 فرد من عمال وإطارات مجموعة بنوك تجارية وباستخدام برنامج SPSS الطبعة 22 تم التوصل إلى تأكيد الدور الكبير للإبداع التكنولوجي في خلق ودعم المركز التنافسي لهذه البنوك.

كلمات مفتاحية : الإبداع التكنولوجي.، الميزة التنافسية.، البنوك التجارية

تصنيفاتL66, M10, M15, O55 JEL

1. INTRODUCTION

Corresponding author: Khedir Oussama: e-mail: oussama.khadir@univ-mascara.dz

In light of the transformations witnessed by the global economy, from a rapid trend towards liberalizing foreign trade and openness towards global markets, and with increasing competition in a dynamic competitive environment as a result of the development of information technology, the need for institutions of all kinds to upgrade and work on development has increased, especially from the point of view of technological progress aimed at creating a competitive advantage that guarantees superiority The institution, and this is through paying attention to the factor of technological innovation in practical reality, which is a fundamental pillar, a strategic choice and a strong incentive to exert more effort to innovate and renew work, as well as the initiative to create innovative new products and services of high quality, to face various potential disruptions in the market and adapt to changes The environment in the economic field, and accordingly, the Algerian commercial banks as an institution to enhance its competitive advantage must embody technological innovation within the institution's environment.

In this sense, the **problem** raised in this context is as follows:

-How can technological innovation contribute to giving Algerian commercial banks a competitive advantage?

-Sub questions:

- What is the relationship between technological innovation and competitive advantage?
- What are the factors that limit the ability of banks as an institution to technological innovation?
- -Does technological innovation contribute to enhancing the competitive advantage of commercial banks in the state of Saida?

-basic hypothesis:

There is a complementary and interactive relationship between technological innovation and achieving the competitive advantage of Algerian commercial banks.

Sub-hypotheses:

We will try to reveal their validity by studying the commercial banks in question. These sub-hypotheses are as follows:

- 1-There is a statistically significant effect between technological creativity and the strategy of discrimination in the commercial banks under consideration.
- 2-There is a statistically significant impact between technological creativity and lower cost strategy in the commercial banks under consideration
- 3-There is a statistically significant impact between technological creativity and the focus strategy of the commercial banks under consideration.

2.the concept of technological innovation

Technological innovation is considered one of the most important basic competitive pillars to adapt to the surrounding changes, by presenting everything that is new to the institution, including the market, and excelling in production in light of the intensification of competition between institutions(El Sawy, Bowles,1997, p.76), and what has increased the importance of the need of all the institution to avoid the risk of disappearance and regression. Before addressing in this research paper the concept of technological creativity, we will first discuss the definition of creativity as a major variable in the study, and we will also explain the relationship between it and innovation and invention, then the methods of generating creative ideas.

2.1. Definition of creativity

The use of the term creativity goes back to the Austrian economist **Joseph Chumpeter** who defined it as: "using resources in a good way with the aim of creating new goods and services." As for the researcher **Peter Drucker** he defines creativity as: "a change in the output of resources, in other words, it is a change in the value and satisfaction resulting from the resources used before consumer". (Fadila, 2017, p.25)

2.2. The relationship between creativity, innovation and invention

There are several terms overlapping with the concept of creativity such as innovation and invention, so we tried to distinguish between them as follows:

- **Innovation**: The relationship between creativity and innovation is an integrated relationship, if creativity is an intellectual process that brings new and unfamiliar ideas by an individual or group, then innovation is emerging and based on creative ideas that are considered the pillar and foundation in the innovative process. (El Karim, 2022, p.10)
- **Invention**: It is the technical solution to a problem, while creativity is the economic application of the invention. Intangible resources such as time and the overall progress in science are the most important in the invention. The researcher **Crawford & Benedet to** believes that managers consider invention as "the unique dimension in the form, formulation, and employment of things, and it takes a short time, while creativity transforms the invention into a product, and it may take a long time. : (Kossek, Young, Gash, 1994, p.37)

We see that invention is part of the creativity process, and that creativity becomes an invention in the stage of application." (El Karim, Ibidem, Loc.Cit)

3. Techniques for generating creative ideas

There are many methods that the organization can adopt to obtain new creative ideas that help embody creativity, and among these methods are the most adopted due to the ease in which they are:

3.1.Brainstorming (generating ideas):

A method that relies on generating many ideas through a group of participants, and it is a discussion circle through which a solution to a specific problem is sought by collecting and restricting all the spontaneous ideas emanating from them, and the first to come up with this method is the thinkerAlex Osborn. The brainstorming includes a minimum of 06 people and a maximum of 12 people, and it goes through a set of steps as follows:

- -Get alternatives and ideas: Invite everyone who has experience to a meeting, and the more experiences the better, where the meeting leader defines the problem and invites the members to propose alternatives with the need to collect the largest possible number of solutions regardless of their quality, and the leader is keen to encourage suggestions and protect their proposals from others, and all this is with the aim of Exciting the mind of the participants. : (Rahmouni, vildizoglu, 2011, p.27)
- **-Solution Alternatives Technique and Ideas**: Explaining the meaning of solutions and grouping similar ones into groups, while encouraging new suggestions and excluding the impossible from solutions.
- The leader serves as a link and encourager for the participating group members, and he is the one who summarizes the solutions. (Zaarour, 2021, p.31)

-Choosing and defining a plan of action:

-Reducing the number of group members and keeping those directly related to the problem.

- Comparing alternative solutions, identifying their advantages and disadvantages, choosing the most appropriate alternative, and determining its application method.
- The leader directs the discussion to choose the most appropriate alternative.

3.2.Six thinking hats

A method that has been widely accepted due to its ease of application. It presents six ways of thinking and calls for not programming the human mind in one style only. His way of thinking is colored by only one pattern, and this way belongs to the researcher. Edward Bono "He divided it into six hats:

- **-white:** responsible for gathering information and knowledge of the current situation and the surrounding problems, i.e. the objective view of things.
- **-Red:** It is related to feelings, that is, the person who wears it says only what he feels about a suggestion, without mentioning the reasons, as it is related to emotion, intuition, and instinctive thinking.
- **-Green:** It provides us with creative ideas, alternatives, options and possibilities, and it is responsible for suggestions, making it the hat of new ideas and creative thinking.
- **-blue:** Its main task is to help control and reach decisions and anticipate results, control the thinking process.
- **-Yellow:** responsible for logic, benefits and showing the value of things, it is the positive logic hat.
- **-Black:** the hat of pessimism and caution, and it is thought in order to know the problems and weaknesses, it is the hat of negative thinking.

Table (1): The Six Hats and Thinking Styles

hats	thinking	comments
	patterns	
The white hat	neutral	It is characterized by objectivity and is based on questioning in order
	thinking	to obtain facts and figures
the Red Hat	emotional	It is based on deep feelings, as well as intuition.
	thinking	
green hat	Creative	It's growth, change, and breaking out of old ideas.
	thinking	
blue hat	Holistic	It is outlook thinking.
	oriented	
	thinking	
yellow hat	Positive	It is based on the Positive Evaluation Line and is a mixture of
	thinking	optimism and a desire to see things through
black hat	negative	It is based on the logic of criticism and pessimism, and it is always in
	thinking.	one negative line.

4.Definition of technological innovation

Before addressing the definition of technological innovation, it is worth mentioning the concept of technology, which means the science of skills or the arts. By definition, it is defined as the effective and effective organization and use of human knowledge and experience, through highly applied means. Accordingly, technological innovation is defined by the researcher **Blom Aker** as: "a set of scientific, technical, organizational, financial and commercial steps, including

investments in new knowledge, which lead to the implementation of new and technically improved processes and products. This is what makes us say that technological innovation is a creative intellectual process that brings new ideas Unfamiliar, and that improving them requires highly specialized competencies, and calls for the use of advanced methods and modern technologies. (Zawawi, 2018, p.13)

4.1. Characteristics and importance of technological innovation

Among the most important characteristics of technological innovation are the following: - Technological innovation should be related to production and productivity, as any innovation that does not lead to improving the production process or the use of production elements, not even providing new products or improving existing ones is not considered technological innovation in the proper sense. (Hajjaj,2015, p.104)

- -Technological innovation is characterized by continuity with the application of new recognized technical knowledge, in addition to the inevitability of providing significant resources, whether financial to support research and development laboratories and effective marketing organizations, or human resources as it needs a significant group of specialized competencies in terms of their formation, technical knowledge and accumulated experience.
- -Technological innovation is a key factor in competition, without its spread in the markets, the market will be limited in effectiveness and efficiency.
- -Technological innovation must be characterized by the ability to discover and seize opportunities, and it is based on a new reading of needs and expectations and a creative vision to discover the new market.

4.2. Technological innovation motives and indicators of its measurement

Among the most motives that lead the institution to achieve technological innovations, is to achieve profit for the institution and strengthen opportunities in order to increase its market share and bear the risks associated with that, and these motives are summarized briefly as follows:

- Intense competition in the market: In order for institutions to maintain their current market position and try to improve it, they must meet the needs and desires of consumers in the best possible way, so you find institutions investing in technological innovations for production methods so that they can introduce new products that satisfy the needs of consumers, and enhance the organization's competitiveness.
- The scientific and technological revolution: which led to the almost immediate application of research results, design and quality improvement, as the period between reaching the results or discoveries and embodying them in the form of products became very short in light of the scientific revolution.
- The possibility of production in large volumes: This means large amounts of profits and a greater reduction in costs as a result of dividing fixed costs by a larger number of units, and then the possibility of selling at competitive prices.
- Government facilities and assistance: provided to support technological innovation processes, whether in the form of technical or financial assistance.
- Social responsibility: Due to the existence of overlapping and mutual relations between institutions and their employees, institutions have become living in a more aware and flexible reality, and are working to increase their contribution to supporting and improving the conditions and capabilities of their employees by adopting activities that support creativity, especially technological creativity, so that they work to develop their creativity based on

being part of the social aspect in which the institution is located, and these improvements are known as social responsibility. (Haines, Petit, 1997, p.17)

4.3 . Definition of competitive advantage

Competitive advantage is defined as an element of the institution's superiority that is achieved if it follows a specific strategy for competition. Competitive advantage is also defined as the ability of the institution to formulate and implement strategies that make it in a better position relative to other institutions in the same activity.

Competitive advantage is divided into two types:

- **-The lowest cost advantage:** It is represented in the institution's ability to design and market the product at the lowest possible cost compared to the costs of competing institutions, which leads to greater returns.
- **-Distinguished Advantage:** It means the company's ability to provide a unique and distinct product

5.A field study of a sample of commercial Al-Bonak in the state of Saida

4.1./Study population and sample

The study population consists of a group of commercial bank employees at the level of the state of Saida, such as the National Bank of Algeria, the Popular Loan, the Local Development Bank and the Algerian Gulf Bank, with different ages, academic qualifications and professional experience, and the questionnaires were distributed according to what indicates to the table

data questionnaires		questionnaires	questionnaires Unrecoverable						
	spreader	retriever							
the bank									
BNA	20	17	03						
CPA	16	16	00						
AGB	07	07	00						
BDL	15	14	01						
Total	58	54	04						

Table (2): Distribution of the study sample

4.2. Analyze the results of the field study

Cronbach's alpha coefficient was used, as the quantitative stability coefficient was estimated at (0.939), as shown in the following table, which indicates the validity and reliability of the questionnaire.

Table (3): Alpha Cronbach's questionnaire validity and reliability

Alpha Cronbach	number ofelements
0,939	54

-Discuss the results of the study:

In order to analyze the results of the study and determine the trends of the respondents' answers, we used the arithmetic means and standard deviations, where the degree of the respondents' evaluation of the phrases and paragraphs of the study was divided as follows:

- 1 to 2.33 low rating.

- From 2.34 to 3.66 average rating.

6. Studying and analyzing the technological innovation variable within the business

To analyze the responses of the study sample on the axis of technological innovation in commercial banks in the state of Saida, 22 phrases were adopted, as shown in the following table:

 $\label{thm:commercial} \textbf{Table (4): Evaluation of the technological innovation hub within the commercial banks}$

Phrase	SMA	deviation	Evaluation
		normative	
Bank employees have the necessary	4,4074	0,71424	
knowledge to perform their duties in			
the best way.			
Bank employees have communication	3,8704	1,06481	
skills in order to convince their			
customers.			
The Bank treats all its clients in a	4,0185	0,96134	
single manner with respect and			
appreciation.			
The continuity and success of the bank	4,0741	0,74863	
depends on satisfying customers			
through the creative performance.			
The bank works to provide all supplies	3,7037	0,94429	
that support efficiency and excellence.			
The bank develops the competencies	4,0370	0,95093	
and skills of the working individuals to			
achieve creativity and excellence.			
Individuals working in the Bank share	3,7593	0,95038	
knowledge through what the old			
employees provide in terms of			
necessary experiences for the new			
employees.			
The Bank has competencies capable of	4,0185	0,85761	
providing creative solutions to			
problems related to their business.			
The bank bases its services	3,6852	0,88646	
development on customer complaints			
and opinions.			
The Bank runs class programs that	3,7778	1,04008	
help the employees to understand the			
management work.			

⁻ From 3.67 to 5 high rating

Khedir Oussama, Saidi Chaimaa and Seddiki Wahida

The Bank encourages the use of new methods and technology to develop	4,1296	0,80203	
new services. The Bank ensures continuous improvement of IT software and hardware.	4,0000	0,80094	
The Bank's management resorts to relying on technology to improve the benefit and quality of the products and services provided.	3,8704	0,82522	
Financial technology helps diversify electronic banking services and achieve each of the financial, marketing and regulatory goals.	4,0185	0,65849	
SMS messages help customers to inquire about their banking transactions.	4,0556	0,78708	
The information technology used contributes to group coordination via (e-mail, conferences and remote meetings) while shortening the time to complete operations and reducing operating costs	4,0185	0,71350	
The bank has a cartoon website to communicate with various dealers and provide services to customers	4,0185	0,78885	
Training courses are organized using information technology (training and e-learning).	3,7778	0,81650	
The technological means available in all the Bank's activities are at the level required to achieve excellence	3,6852	0,94817	
The information technology available to the bank's employees facilitates rapid communication with customers	3,8333	0,92655	
Modern technologies and electronic devices enable the provision of services with high efficiency	4,1481		0,81048
The bank seeks to improve the service provision processes by designing and developing maintenance systems in the event of a malfunction of work equipment.	3,9259	1,02519	
The axis of technological innovation	3,9469	0,86462	

The evaluation of the study sample for this axis received high approval ratings because its arithmetic mean exceeds the value of (3.94), which expresses high approval ratings

according to the Likert scale, and therefore the study sample of commercial banks in Saida agree with a high degree of questions asked to them related to technological innovation. With an arithmetic mean approximately equal to (3.95), and a standard deviation of (0.86), which is the amount of dispersion of the sample's answers at the arithmetic mean (3.95). Based on the foregoing, the level of evaluation of the respondents for the axis of technological innovation was high.

7. Studying and analyzing the variable of competitive advantage within commercial banks in the state of Saida

In order to analyze the responses of the study sample on the axis of competitive advantage in the commercial banks in the state of Saida, 16 phrases were adopted as shown in the following tables:

Table (5): The response of the study sample towards the lowest cost

the test	SMA	deviation	Evaluation
paragraphs		normative	
When reducing the costs of the	3,9259	0,82332	
service provided, the bank			
contributes to increasing			
customer satisfaction.			
The bank is always keen on	4,0000	0,78619	
innovation and development			
of ways and means to reduce			
costs.			
Work to reduce the cost while	4,0000	0,78885	
maintaining the foundations of			
excellence compared to other			
banks.			
The Bank seeks to reduce the	3,9259	0,98415	
costs of its services through			
technological innovation			
without compromising the			
quality of service.			
Reducing the service	4,2037	1,02109	
collection deadlines by the			
bank is considered the basis of			
the competitive advantage.			
weighted arithmetic mean.	4,0111	0,88072	
-		·	

We note that the evaluation of the study sample for this axis received high approval ratings because its arithmetic mean is (4.01), which expresses high approval ratings according to the Likert scale, and therefore the study sample of commercial banks in Saida agree with a high degree of the questions asked to them related to the lowest cost strategy, with an arithmetic mean approximately equal to (4.01), and a standard deviation (0.88), which is the amount of dispersion of the sample's answers at the arithmetic mean (4.01).

Based on the foregoing, the level of evaluation of the respondents for the least cost dimension was high.

Table (6): The response of the study sample towards the focus

the test	SMA	Deviation normative	Evaluation
paragraphs			
The bank focuses on meeting the	3,9259	0,968400	
needs and desires of customers			
in a timely manner.			
The Bank focuses on providing	4,0000	0,971290	
its services to a specific sector			
The bank focuses on	4,0000	0,931620	
maintaining its reputation and			
brand in front of the customer.			
The bank focuses on	3,9259		
technological innovation to		0,948720	
facilitate the process of granting			
real estate loans to private			
individuals.			
The Bank focuses on providing	4,2037	0,761820	
travel and assistance insurance			
services abroad.			
weighted arithmetic mean.	4,0111	0,91637	

We note that the evaluation of the study sample for this axis obtained high approval ratings because its arithmetic mean is equal to (4.01), which expresses high approval ratings according to the Likert scale, and therefore the study sample of commercial banks in Saida agree with a high degree on the questions asked to them regarding the focus strategy, with an arithmetic mean approximately equal to (4.01), and a standard deviation of (0.92), which is the amount of dispersion of the sample's answers at the arithmetic mean (4.01).

Binary Correlation Coefficient, Coefficient of Determination, and Multiple Linear Regression Equation: After examining the influence relationship between the independent variable technological innovation and the dimensions of the dependent variable competitive advantage, we will test the main hypothesis and reveal the relationship and role of the independent variable on the dependent variable.

Table (7): Evidence of the first sub-hypothesis table

Form summary	

	correlation The coe		ne coefficient	valu	Significance
There is a statistically	coefficient	fficient of		eF	level
significant effect between		de	termination		
technological innovation	0,641	0,4	411	36,3	0,000
and discrimination strategy				27	
in the banks under study.	Estimation of model parameters			eters	
			В	Significa	ance level
	Constant		2,052	0,000	
	Discriminat	ion	0,492		

Through the above table, we note that there is a statistically significant positive effect of technological innovation in achieving competitive advantage through the discrimination strategy, and since the level of significance is equal to (0.000), which is less than (0.05), then we accept the null hypothesis, and reject the alternative, and the value of the square Correlation (interpretation or determination coefficient) refers to (41.1%) of the variation in achieving technological innovation for competitive advantage through the discrimination strategy. The value of the binary correlation coefficient for discrimination amounted to (0.641), and through the values contained in column B, the value of b0 is equal to (2,052) and the value of the independent variable represented by creativity is equal to (0.492). This means that the increase in achieving the competitive advantage by (41.1%) is due to the degree of increase in technological innovation.

Table (8): Evidence of the validity of the second sub-hypothes

Form summary								
There is a statistically significant effect between technological innovation	correlation coefficient 0,580	determination		ueF	Significance level 0,000			
and the lowest cost strategy					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
in the banks under study		B 2,197		S	ignificance level			
	Constant The lowest	0,436		0	.000			
	cost							

Through the above table, we notice that there is a statistically significant positive effect of technological innovation in achieving the competitive advantage through the lowest cost strategy, and since the level of significance is equal to (0.000), i.e. less than (0.05), we accept the null hypothesis, and reject the alternative hypothesis, and the value of the square Correlation (interpretation or determination coefficient) refers to (33.6%) of the variation in achieving technological innovation for competitive advantage through the lowest cost strategy. The value of the binary correlation coefficient was (0.580), and through the values contained in column B, the value of b0 It is equal to (2,197) and the value of the independent

variable represented in technological innovation is equal to (0.436). This means that the increase in achieving competitive advantage by (33.6%) is due to the increase in technological innovation.

Table (9): Evidence for the validity of the third sub-hypothesis

Form summary							
There is a statistically	correlation	The coefficient of	ValueF	Significance			
significant effect	coefficient	determination		level			
between technological	0,611	0,374	31,008	0,000			
innovation and		T 4 4 6 1	1				
concentration strategy		Estimation of mode	el parameter	'S			
in the banks under		В	Significa	nce level			
study.	Constant	1,892	0.000				
	the focus	0,524					

The results of the table indicate that there is a statistically significant positive effect of technological innovation in achieving competitive advantage through the focus strategy, and since the level of significance is equal to (0.000), which is less than (0.05), then we accept the null hypothesis, and reject the alternative hypothesis, and the value of the correlation square (interpretation or determination coefficient) refers to (37.4%) of the variance in achieving technological innovation for competitive advantage through the concentration strategy and the value of the binary correlation coefficient in relation to concentration amounted to (0.611), and through the values contained in column B, the value of b0 It is equal to (1,892), and the value of the independent variable represented in technological innovation is equal to (0.524). This means that the increase in achieving competitive advantage by (37.4%) is due to the increase in technological innovation.

9. CONCLUSION

Through our field study at the level of a group of commercial banks, it is evident that there is a strong and morally influential relationship between both technological creativity and technology on achieving competitive advantage. which requires the banks in question to pay greater attention to this aspect in order to ensure their sustainability and survival, This answers the problems of our study and emphasizes that technological creativity has a positive impact on competitive advantage in order (Discrimination, lower cost, concentration) to come first with 41, 1%, followed by focus second by 37,4%, then last ranked the lowest cost by 33, 6%. In conclusion, Algerian commercial banks have significant challenges to the ability to compete with international banks. The first challenge lies in the imperative of embracing technological creativity to achieve competitive advantage and enhance market standing. Because the results of our field study confirm that there is a fair and positive correlation between the two variables.

9.Bibliography List:

Journal article:

El Sawy, O., & Bowles, G. (1997). Redesigning the customer support process for the electronic economy: insights from storage dimensions. MIS Quarterly, 21(4), 457-483.

Haines, V. Y., & Petit, A. (1997). Conditions for successful human resource information systems. Human Resource Management, 36, 261–275.

Kossek, E. E., Young, W., Gash, D. C., & Nichol, V. (1994). Waiting for innovation in the human-resources department – Godot implements a human-resource information system. HumanResource Management, 33, 135–159.

-Rahmouni, m., & yildizoglu, m. (2011, mars). Motivations et déterminants de l'innovation technologique: Un survol des théories modernes, groupement de recherche en economie quantitative d'aix, p. 04

-Zaarour Naima, (2021), Creativity as an entry point to achieve a competitive advantage for enterprises, Al-Manhal Al-Iqtisadi Journal, Al-Wadi University, Algeria, Volume 4, Issue 3.

3. Theses:

-Amir Fadila, (2017). The Impact of Technological Innovation on the Competitive Strategies of Institutions, PhD thesis, Management Sciences, University of Tlemcen, Algeria.

-Abdel Raouf Hajjaj. (2015). The role of technological innovation in achieving the competitive advantage of the economic institution, a comparative study between the units of the Condor Foundation in Bordj Bou Arreridj, using the data envelope analysis method during the period 2004-2013, PhD thesis, Faculty of Economic Sciences, Commercial Sciences and Management Sciences: University of Ouargla, Algeria.

Hamida Zawawi. (2018). Technological innovation as an entry point to gaining a sustainable competitive advantage in the Algerian economic institution, a case study of an economic institution, PhD thesis, Faculty of Economic, Commercial and Management Sciences: University of Algiers.

الكريم كريم. (2022). استراتيجية الإبداع و تكنولوجيا المعلومات لتعزيز القدرة التنافسية للمؤسسات الجزائرية في تحقيق التنمية المستدامة. أطروحة مقدمة لنيل شهادة الدكتوراه في العلوم الاقتصادية والعلوم الاقتصادية والعلوم التجارية وعلوم التسيير، جامعة أبو بكر بلقايد، تلمسان، الجزائر، ص 10.